

Proceedings of Environmental Public Hearing held on dated 20.09.2014 at 11:00 AM for Nakthan Hydroelectric Project (460MW) in Barshani Village, Distt- Kullu, H.P.

Environmental Public Hearing has been conducted by Himachal Pradesh State Pollution Control Board for setting up Nakthan HEP (460MW) by Himachal Pradesh Power Corporation Ltd in a open ground near Sr. Sec. School, Barshani on 20.09.2014 at 11:00 AM under the Chairmanship of Sh. Vinay Singh, Additional District Magistrate, Kullu as per provisions of EIA notification No-SO -1533 (E) dated 14.09.2006. The name with address of officers, officials and committee members, who were present in the meeting, are given in annexure-A. On the outset of meeting, the regional officer, HPPC, Kullu has welcomed the chief guest and others/public of Barshani Panchyat assembled to participate in the meeting and apprised regarding the project. It has also been intimated by him regarding the rules of Govt. to minimize the pollution in the environment. Thereafter, General Manager, Sainj HEP has given the broad idea regarding the layout of the scheme. Besides, the scientist of ICFRE, Dehradun has apprised the public regarding EIA/EMP & SIA study carried out for Nakthan HEP. The General Manager, Sainj HEP, HPPCL has also requested local people of Barshani Panchyat to cooperate of HPPCL for implementation of this scheme and thanked for their presence in the meeting.


The above said hearing has been started by Representative of HPPCB, Kullu with a request to public to give suggestions, views, comments and objections to the subject cited project with the permission of respected Chairman.

The detail of the questions asked and reply given by the project authorities are given below in tabular form:-

Sr. No.	Asked by	Question	Reply
1.	Sh. Jai Ram Thakur along with all Villagers of Vill- Tosh, PO- Barshani, Tehsil- Bhunter Distt- Kullu (HP).	Sir, With humble submission it is stated that the Nakthan Hydroelectric Project (460MW) which is proposed to be constructed in the mountain (hill) between village Tosh and Nakthan. Issuance of "No Objection Certificate" is not proper on account of following reasons:- 1. On this mountain and surrounding area there exists most ancient Glaciers which are providing cool and clean environment, which is being already affected by the Parbati Hydroelectric Project.	Sh. Ramesh Chaudhry, General Manager (Project) informed that two nos of barrage, one over Parbati river having height of 13.5 mtr at Nihara Thach and other on Tosh Nallah of height of 12 mtr near Wanshil Thach similar to Larji barrage (already constructed). From here the water through tunnel will be collected at common meeting point on situated on left bank of Budhavan. Then further it will flow through common HRT to Power house to harness 460 MW power. Regarding the matter of Rudarnag holy place, we have further shifted the

Addl. Distt. Magistrate
KULLU (H.P.)

	<p>Therefore, by the construction of this project (460MW) the existence of these glaciers will come to end.</p> <p>2. By the construction of this project thousand of trees and struts will be damaged, resulting with increase of global warming as world is already facing this problem.</p> <p>3. On this mountain many kinds of herbal medicine plants exists from which they are earning their livelihood since ancient time. By the pollution of project construction the quality of medicine plant will be affected & their existence will be in danger, and will face the problem of their livelihood.</p> <p>4. The soil of this hill is black and sandy and very soft, by the construction work of project there will be more landslides on account of this there will be danger to Nakthan village.</p> <p>5. Village Nakthan is situated in the vicinity of this mountain/hill. There will be more landslides by the construction of this 460MW project and there is direct danger to village Nakthan and will cause heavy damaged to mankind /property.</p> <p>6. To what people term as "Nature" this mountain is its home, so by this reason we consider that as a temple and worship it. Here we complete our religious culture faith activities. In this hill there is a famous holy</p>	<p>proposed tunnel alignment (coming from Parbati side) i.e. 4 Km horizontally away from the confluence point of Rudernag nalla & river Parbati. Earlier the total length of proposed HRT's was 8 Km, which has now been increased to 12 Km keeping in view the importance of Rudar nag religious place. Keeping in view of the quality of herbs & roots, we have kept sufficient provision in Environment Management Plan (EMP). Separate sufficient provision has also been kept for plants & water bodies for their safeguard. The proposed project will be constructed by keeping in view the problem of land slide.</p> <p>As per the LADA policy of Govt. of Himachal Pradesh, 1.5% amount of the total cost of the proposed project will be spent on the development of the affected people of Panchayat. The amount will be deposited to the Deputy Commissioner office. As per the new provision made by Govt. of Himachal Pradesh, 1 % of the generation amount will be distributed between affected families.</p>
--	---	--


 Addl. Dist. Magistrate
 KULLU (H.P.)

	<p>place named Ruderani Rudernag, where most people from Dist. Kullu & Mandi (Saraj) oftenly come for holy bath and worship.</p> <p>7. By construction of project, sound pollution is increasing hereby affecting the divine power of Devtas (Lords) resulting in the disturbing of peoples mind and are suiciding since the construction of the projects in this area, more then 25 people of Barshani Panchyat have suicided without any reason. So to disturb this mountain will be against the Dev culture maryada</p> <p>8. The water of this holy place is as pure as Gangajal and considered reason on account of this. The People of Barshaini Panchayat do not carry the ashes remains to Haridwar. Our religious works are performed by the water of this mountain. By the construction of project the quality of this water will be affected and may also dry up.</p> <p>9. There are five hydroelectric project under construction stage in Panchyat Barshaini. Some project have been completed and there is almost nil employment to local peoples. By saying that there will be development by construction of project. In fact there is no development, which is in the knowledge of Govt.</p> <p>10. Even after the construction of five</p>	
--	---	--

1
Addl. Distt. Magistrate
KULLU (H.P.)

		<p>projects the people of Barshani Panchyat live in dark.</p> <p>11. We appeal that our this Mahakendra of faith should not be destroyed and status quo be maintained. If any disturbance to this will be harmful to all of us and may create very bad results which will be intolerable. These bad results will not only be to local people and Dev Samaj but will also be for the whole of countrymen. Sir, we may have to regret in future. So we appeal the Govt. and construction agency HPPCL to stop the work of project. Lest we may regret in future.</p> <p>12. Sir, we are not against the development, as you know we have never raised any objection for earlier five projects. Sir, we affected villagers of Barshani Panchyat consisting of eight villages and all attached to Dev Samaj from Kullu & Mandi Distt. want development but oppose Nakthan project because it is attached to our religious faith.</p> <p>13. If the construction of the said Hydroelectric Project is carried out, even after our objection, then we all Devlu Samaj & affected villagers will be forced to start struggle (A copy of above mentioned question is attached).</p>	
2	Sh. Hari Singh	We considered Rudernag as our holy	The project authority clarified that issue


Addl. Distt. Magistrate
KULLU (H.P.)

	Negi, Vill. Dhunkhra, P.O. Jari, Teh. Bhunter, Distt. Kullu (HP).	place, therefore Nakthan Project should not be constructed, because hill of Rudernag is back bone of our village. It should not be disturbed/drilled. This voice should reach to Center Govt. Delhi through Videography.	at Sr. No-1 above.
3.	Sh. Kehar Singh, Vill. Barshaini, P.O. Barshaini, Teh. Bhunter, Distt. Kullu (HP).	We have been affected earlier by NHPC project firstly NHPC promised to give us school, employment & road etc, but there is no provision till date. This area comes under seismic zone area. Due to implementation of project and flood, Manikaran including half of Himachal Pradesh will be destroyed and may happen like Kedarnath & Jammu Kashmir.	The General Manger, Sainj HEP, HPPCL has told that Kullu & Mandi districts come under seismic zone-v. Keeping the fact in mind, the heights of barrages have been kept as 13.5mtr and 12mtr respectively and having very less storage capacity. As per the LADA policy of Govt. of Himachal Pradesh, 1.5% amount of the total cost of the proposed project will be spent on the development of the affected Panchayat people. The amount will be deposited to the Deputy Commissioner office. As per the new policy of Govt. of Himachal Pradesh, 1 % of the generation amount will be distributed between affected families.
4.	Sh. Arjun Singh, Vill. Barshaini, P.O. Barshaini, Teh. Bhunter, Distt. Kullu (HP).	It is discussed with project management that all the works will we done by TBM. But all the works are being executed by blasting.	The General Manager, Sainj HEP, Sarabai has said that I have also told this earlier that the Tunnel coming from Parbati side will be executed by using TBM and tunnel from Tosh side will be executed by drill blast method. Besides, remaining components of proposed project will also executed by drill blast method.
5.	Sh. Chander Singh, Vill. Tahuk, P.O. Barshaini, Teh.	I want to ask to the people of Pollution Control Board that our daily life have been affected and out of 20-40 Crore amount of LADA to Barshaini	The officer of Pollution Control board clarified that they collect the samples of air & water from time to time and same are analyzed. But we do not deal with

↓
Addl. Distt. Magistrate
KULLU (H.P.)

	Bhunter, Distt. Kullu (HP).	Panchyat , recently we came to know that only 15-20 % amount is available. During the construction of road from Manikaran to Barshani by NHPC Project, the land slide of upper portion of road for which compensation has been paid thousand bighas of land has been destroyed due to this slide for which no compensation has been given.	land and compensation.
6.	Sh. Om Prakash Sharma, Zila Parishad Member.	Has project management obtained NOC from the villagers ? If not then what is the use of this Environmental Public Hearing. This hearing can be held again. Where are the care taker of Nakthan? The meeting was held with you by Dev Samaj three times. These Devi & Devta say something one day and say something other day. We are not against the project, but NOC should be taken from Panchyat first.	The project authority clarified this meeting has been conducted in line with relevant procedure and related to Environmental Public Hearing and it is not related with the process of Panchayat NOC. The process of the Panchayat NOC will be conducted separately.
7	Sh. Than Singh, Vice President Barshaini, Teh. Bhunter, Distt. Kullu (HP).	I want ask to from Pollution Control Board that if there are thousand water fall in Panchyat then what is the capacity of one Panchyat for the construction of projects. Whereas six projects have already been constructed in my Panchyat. There are many wild animals, where they will go ? 22000 number of trees have been cut down by NHPC project, but no plantation have been done in lieu of that. By constructed the tunnel our water source will be dried up and Rudernag is our main holy place & it should not be disturbed.	The officer of Pollution Control Board. Kullu has clarified that the issue regarding sanction/implementation of number of hydel scheme on one catchment is decided by Govt. and MoEF. The detailed study of small hydel scheme is done by Department of Him-Urja Govt. of HP. Moreover, your suggestions will be delivered to the Govt. of India through Videography. The Chief Environmental Specialist, Shimla has intimated that your suggestions shall be forwarded to high level committee of Govt. India for implementation. However, this meeting is being conducting for Environmental

Advt. Distt. Magistrate
KULLU (H.P.)

		Public Hearing.
8.	Sh. Hira Lal, Distt. Kullu Devi & Devta Kardar Sangh Vill. Pathla, P.O. Jari, Teh. Bhunter, Distt. Kullu (HP).	<p>1. After getting information regarding construction of Nakthan HEP by HPPCL, from area Kardar Dev Sangh and Newspapers detailed discussions were held and serious worry/thought took place that in this project area there is an ancient religious, cultural and natural monument called Ludemag of Distt. Kullu and other area of Devi Devtas. By the execution of project and other activities this religious cultural & natural environment of holy place will be adversely affected and any activity /disturbance in this area is not tolerable to Devi Devtas, Dev Samaj and local people. Therefore Distt. Kullu Kardar Sangh of Manikaran Block opposes to the construction of Nakthan HEP in the interest of Dev & Public. It is also resolved in the meeting that the copy of this resolution may be sent to Govt./Administration, Public representatives and other creative organizations</p> <p>2. The Sabha also welcomed the Agenda of Gram Panchyat Barshani dated 22.02.2011 not to issue the NOC for the construction of Nakthan HEP to HPPCL and all conveyed thanks to Gram Sabha, Panchyat representatives, Dev Samaj and all the public of</p>

Adar. Distt. Magistrate
KULLU (H.P.)

		<p>Barshani Panchyat for coming forward to protect the heritage of Rudernag holy place.</p> <p>(A copy of above mentioned question is attached)</p> <p>3. This area comes under seismic zone, at what altitude these hydro projects would be constructed? Recently HP Govt. has constituted Abhay Sukla Committee. What happened of that and implementation is taken regarding that projects should not be constructed above 7000 feet altitude. What is being done by you? Is this first Environmental Public Hearing? Any meeting was held with Environment Ministry? Apprise whether the environment will be exist by replantation of trees by center/state Govt. and replantaion is carried out after falling of trees. The growing of conifer trees requires at least six months of rainfall in a year. Money can't give birth to plantation, trees require rain for growth.</p>	
9.	Sh. Bhim Sen, Vill. Barshaini, P.O. Barshaini, Teh. Bhunter, Dist. Kullu (HP).	We want to say to HPPCL & Environmental Officers that we are not against the projects. There should be projects. As important our faith is same importance is of our future and development. Only in the name of faith we cannot live in the wild atmosphere. I am not hurting the sentiments of anybody and welcome the sentiments of	The General Manager, Sainj HEP, Sarabai has apprised earlier the scheme was allotted to NHPC for implementation. But the scheme was abandoned by MoEF, Govt. of India with the remarks that dam is located at high altitude i.e. 3500mtr and is in glacier zone. No such study has been made regarding the beginning point of


 Addl. Dist. Magistrate
 KULLU (H.P.)

		<p>all. Psychological conspiracy is being done with you people. It is good that these people stand together with religious emotions. There should be no disturbance with Rudernag, in order to save religious place both things are important. Can HPPCL tell that which glacier is the beginning point (origin) of water? By constructing this project the water source of Rudernag will dry up. What happen, have you any scientific guarantee about this? From this Glacier point will be affected.</p>	<p>river from glaciers. The Chief Environmental Specialist, Shimla has intimated that the tunnel coming from Parbati side was aligned from same side of mountain from where Rudernag nalla comes down. Now this has been shifted 4 Km away from the confluence of Rudernag nalla & Parbati river and located other side of same hill. This final proposal will not disturbed-the water of Rudernag nalla.</p>
10.	<p>Sh. Hari Singh Ex-President Barshaini, Teh. Bhunter, Distt. Kullu (HP).</p>	<p>State Electricity Board sold Parbati Project to NHPC and today why HPPCL come to construct the project? Mutation No. 2535 has not been done till date NHPC should give answer within three months and it should be entered in the ownership of NHPC and compensation should be released. What was the rate of Land during the 1968-69 and what is the rate today? There are hundreds of peoples whose land holding is less than 5 Bighas. What is the definition of Landless? There is no Law & order since 1968-69. Rudernag should not be disturbed.</p>	
11.	<p>Sh. Des Raj Thakur, Vill. Barshaini, P.O. Barshaini, Teh. Bhunter, Distt. Kullu (HP).</p>	<p>What is the rights with Pollution Control Board? Our crops and apples are being destroyed and Animals drink dirty water and be talk of education, schools are in bad conditions.</p>	<p>The reply has already been made at Sr. No-5 above.</p>
12.	<p>Sh. Krishan Chand Thakur, Vill.</p>	<p>The question asked by the villagers at Sr. No.1, should be answered first. We</p>	<p>The General Manager, Sainj HEP, Sarabai has intimated that this project</p>

2
Addl. Distt. Magistrate
KULLU (H.P.)


	Barshaini, P.O. Barshaini, Teh. Bhunter, Distt. Kullu (HP).	have in full majority said that we don't want project. Gram Panchayat earlier also passed resolution that we don't need project. We completely oppose because it is affecting Rudernag, the centre of religious faith.	was allotted to HPPCL by Govt. of HP five years back. Subsequently the investigation works were started at site as per decisions taken during Nov, 2012 under the Chairmanship of Sub-Divisional Magistrate, Kullu. It has also been intimated that the works which are being carried out with prior permission of Govt.
13.	Sh. Tej Singh, Vill. Nakthan, P.O. Barshaini, Teh. Bhunter, Distt. Kullu (HP).	It is the Holy place of Distt Kullu & Mandi Devi-Devtas. Our village is badly affected, because a big drift of about 15 mtr is construed in such a narrow hill. Are we safe, we will get displaced. When stone will fall on our heads where we will go? We all are opposing this project why the testing and investigation of this project is being done. If this is continued we will throw these testing Machines. So it should not be constructed, we don't want project.	The project authority clarified that most of issues have already been at Sr. No-1 & 5 above respectably.

At the end of Environmental Public Hearing the Chairman said that this public hearing is not related with the process of NOC by Gram Panchayat. Its process will be separately and Govt. will decide after wards whether the project should be constructed or not. What are its impact on environment? What so ever are the problems will be sent to Govt. of India. I thank all the public for giving their suggestions. The purpose of today's programme is only to put before you the environmental study which has been done. Terms of references were issued by Ministry of Environmental GOI after that only project authority was allowed to move forward to study the impact on the Environment if the project is constructed and what will be the remedies to mitigate the same. These are the two issues for which this hearing was conducted. It has no concern with NOC process and it will be taken up separately. The problems you have put up, the objections you have expressed, the doubts you have raised whether it is related to your religious faith or your divine belief or related with any component of the project regarding which you feel that it may lead to any natural calamity, any activity done by the project which may lead to any financial loss. In Himachal, the people of the valley depends upon forest. If you think that soil erosion and extinction of medicinal herbs & roots will affect your lively hood & whatever the loss will occur due to project activities for that project management has made a provision of Rs. 57.00 crore so that the loss can be

Addl. Distt. Magistrate
KULLU (H.P.)

compensated. Whether it is invested in CAT plan or in plantation or in construction of Schools and Hospitals or in other Public works. 13.61 lac. cum of muck which will generate from project components will be utilized half for filling and remaining 50% will be dumped in dumping sites. The concerned project authority will go ahead by keeping your problems in consideration. With the hope that the suggestions given here by you people, the project management will take an appropriate action. I thanks and welcome the all who are assembled here for meeting. I at last really thankful to all the people attended the meeting.

DA:- as above


Add. Distt. Magistrate,
Distt. Kullu (HP)

Distt: Kullu (HP).

Detail of issues during public hearing on 20.09.2014 at 11:00 AM for proposed Nakthan Hydro Electric Power Project (HPPCL) for 460 MW at open ground near Govt. Sen. Sec. School Barshaini, Tehsil Kullu, Distt Kullu (H.P).

During Public Hearing the people participated actively and various issues like faith on Rudarnag, compensation, rehabilitation, pollution, employment due to construction of the project components were raised. Proper rehabilitation, faith on Rudarnag and resettlement of the project affected families with adequate compensation and adequate plantation were the major concerns. In addition to this public has given the views as below:

S.No.	Issues raised	Remarks on the issues raised
1.	The public raised major concern about the religious faith on Rudarnag.	Sh. Ramesh Chaudhry, General Manager of Sainj HEP informed that regarding the matter of Rudarnag holy place, we have further shifted the proposed tunnel alignment (coming from Parhati side) i.e. 4 Km horizontally away from the confluence point of Rudarnag nalla & river Parhati. Earlier the total length of proposed HRT's was 8 Km, which has now been increased to 12 Km keeping in view the importance of Rudarnag religious place.
2.	The people demanded employment, development (like opening of schools and hospital etc.) from the project proponent and asked to ensure 70 % employment to the residents of Himachal Pradesh.	The project authority clarified that employment to the affective families will be provided as per R&R policy of Govt.of Himachal Pradesh. As per the LADA policy of Govt. of Himachal Pradesh, 1.5% amount of the total cost of the proposed project will be spent on the development of the affected people of Panchayat. The amount will be deposited to the Deputy Commissioner office. As per the new provision made by Govt. of Himachal Pradesh, 1 % of the generation amount will be distributed between affected families.
3.	The public shown its concern about the environmental pollution due to the proposed project and increase in temperature due to green house gases & degradation of environment & ecology of this area.	The project authority clarified that all the possible measures shall be taken as per EMP for control of pollution. For this main thrust shall be plantation on sufficient land.
4.	Study of assimilative capacity of the area w.r.t total hydro electric project to be sanctioned & inter distances from each other.	The officer of Pollution Control Board, Kullu has clarified that the issue regarding sanction/implementation of number of hydel scheme on one catchment is decided by Govt. and MoEF. The detailed study of small hydel scheme is done by Department of Him-Urja Govt. of HP. Moreover, your suggestions will be delivered to the Govt. through Videography. The Chief Environmental Specialist, H.P.P.C.I. Shimla has intimated that your suggestions shall be forwarded to high level committee of Govt. India for implementation. However, this meeting is being conducting for Environmental Public Hearing.